Outline

• Types of uncertainty
• Uncertainty in homicide
• Missing persons as homicides
• Uncertainty in the court process
• Gaps in theory
• Unsolved homicides
• Conclusions
Uncertainty and Homicide: Identifying the gaps in theory and practice

Damon A Muller
Michael Smithson
ARC Centre of Excellence in Policing and Security
Australian National University
Types of Uncertainty

- Typology (Smithson 1989)
  - Distortion (confusion or inaccuracy) – underreporting and unsolved homicides
  - Incompleteness (absence or uncertainty) – Reasonable doubt in criminal trials
- Reducible and irreducible unknowns
- Uncertainty entails tradeoffs
Typology of Uncertainty

(Source: Smithson, 1989)
Identifying Homicides

- Australian homicide rate of 1.5 per 100,000 population (2005-06)
  - Approx 300 victims per year
- Non-report rates ("dark figure") probably low
- Uncertainty in true rate of homicide low
Missing Persons

- Missing person rate 1.7 per 1,000 population
  - Approx 35,000 missing persons per year
  - 90 percent located in seven says (Victoria)
  - Little published information on how many missing persons are homicides
  - 0.6 percent found dead in UK (2000-02)
  - Approx 5 missing persons per year are homicides in Australia at UK rates
  - Does not greatly distort Australian homicide rate
Missing Persons as Homicides

- Risk factors have been identified for missing persons at risk of foul play
- Demographic factors unreliable predictors
- Statistical models tend to outperform professional judgement (e.g., medical diagnosis)
- Rarity of deaths makes prediction difficult
- Example of an irreducible uncertainty
Uncertainty in the court process

- Homicide acquittals
  - Little research on acquittal for homicide
  - Victoria 1981-1987:
    - Murder charge: 16% acquitted
    - Manslaughter charge: 25% acquitted
  - Victoria 1997-2001
    - Criminal homicide charge: 10% acquitted
- Little comparative data
  - Rape 1997-1998 (Victoria): 50% acquittal
- Acquittals may be errors of judgement by police/prosecutor or judge/jury
Homicide data

- Proportion of homicide incidents cleared
  - Australia: 92% (2006-05); 89% (1990-2000)
  - US: 62% (2006); 94% (1961)
  - UK: 8.3%
  - Japan: 95%
  - Germany: 96%
Unsolved homicides

- Not all homicides equally likely to remain unsolved
- Characteristics associated with unsolved homicides
  - Increased clearance rate: young, female
  - Decreased clearance rate: firearms, other crimes
- Little consideration of different types of homicides
- More likely to be unsolved if ‘unknown’ scenario
Gaps in the theory

- Homicide datasets widely used for theory formation and hypothesis testing
  - Datasets often incomplete
- Significant gap in knowledge with regard to uncleared cases
- Some types of homicide will be underrepresented
  - more likely to be unsolved
What it takes to solve homicides?

• Prediction models that distinguish between solved and unsolved cases may help with investigative resource allocation

• May be able to model resources needed to clear the case

• Survival analysis on solved and unsolved homicides
  
  ❖ Data is well suited to the analysis
  ❖ No suitable databases available?
Conclusions

• Between missing persons, unsolved cases and acquittals, up to 20% of homicides may be unknown

• Not all homicides are equally likely to be solved
  - Young victims & female victims more likely solved
  - Homicides involving firearms and “felony homicides” more likely to be unsolved

• Implications for homicide theory

• Implications for investigative resource allocation